

PROGRAM EVALUATION OF CHINESE–FOREIGN COOPERATIVE EDUCATION AT FUZHOU VOCATIONAL AND TECHNICAL COLLEGE USING THE CIPP FRAMEWORK

AVALIAÇÃO DO PROGRAMA DE EDUCAÇÃO COOPERATIVA SINO-ESTRANGEIRA NO COLÉGIO VOCACIONAL E TÉCNICO DE FUZHOU UTILIZANDO O QUADRO CIPP

Article received on: 9/3/2025

Article accepted on: 11/3/2025

Tan Nuo*

*Educational Science Department, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, China
novatanid@gmail.com

Putu Kerti Nitiasih**

**M.A. Educational Science Department, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia
kertinitiasih@undiksha.ac.id

Made Hery Santosa***

***PhD. Educational Science Department, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia
mhsantosa@undiksha.ac.id

Putu Nanci Riastini*

*Educational Science Department, Postgraduate Program, Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia
putunanci.riastini@undiksha.ac.id

The authors declare that there is no conflict of interest

Abstract

This research evaluates the Chinese international collaboration at Fuzhou Vocational and Technical College using CIPP evaluation framework. The context analysis examined needs assessment, stakeholder perspectives, institutional objectives. The input evaluation assessed the availability of resources, the robustness of program design, the quality of partnership engagement. The process evaluation focused on instructional delivery, student academic and emotional support systems, stakeholder communication, and the responsiveness of monitoring and feedback structures. The product evaluation measured key outcomes including student learning performance, graduate employment rates, institutional development, and broader societal and cultural impacts. Data were collected through surveys distributed to students, faculty, and administrative staff to ensure multi-perspective insight. CIPP assessment results revealed differing perceptions across stakeholder groups: students (- + + +), faculty (+ + - +), and administrators (+ + + -). Given the overall favorable evaluations of context, process, and

Resumo

Esta pesquisa avalia a colaboração internacional chinesa no Colégio Vocacional e Técnico de Fuzhou utilizando a estrutura de avaliação CIPP. A análise de contexto examinou a avaliação de necessidades, as perspectivas das partes interessadas e os objetivos institucionais. A avaliação de insumos avaliou a disponibilidade de recursos, a robustez do projeto do programa e a qualidade do engajamento da parceria. A avaliação de processo focou na oferta de instrução, nos sistemas de apoio acadêmico e emocional aos alunos, na comunicação com as partes interessadas e na capacidade de resposta das estruturas de monitoramento e feedback. A avaliação de produto mensurou os principais resultados, incluindo o desempenho de aprendizagem dos alunos, as taxas de emprego dos graduados, o desenvolvimento institucional e os impactos sociais e culturais mais amplos. Os dados foram coletados por meio de questionários distribuídos a alunos, professores e funcionários administrativos para garantir uma visão multiperspectiva. Os resultados da avaliação CIPP revelaram percepções



product, maintaining existing strengths while proactively addressing implementation gaps is critical. Sustained alignment between program objectives and stakeholder expectations, efficient execution, and measurable outcomes remain essential for long-term success.

Keywords CIPP. Chinese Program. Evaluation. Foreign Cooperation.

diferentes entre os grupos de partes interessadas: alunos (- + + +), professores (+ + - +) e administradores (+ + + -). Dado o geral das avaliações favoráveis de contexto, processo e produto, manter os pontos fortes existentes enquanto se aborda proativamente as lacunas de implementação é fundamental. O alinhamento contínuo entre os objetivos do programa e as expectativas das partes interessadas, a execução eficiente e os resultados mensuráveis permanecem essenciais para o sucesso a longo prazo.

Palavras-chave: CIPP. Programa Chinês. Avaliação. Cooperação Internacional.

1 INTRODUCTION

China's pursuit of the internationalization of higher education is grounded in the theory that introducing advanced foreign educational philosophies, teaching methods, and management models can enhance the quality and competitiveness of its institutions. As Altbach and Knight (2007) argue, internationalization is a strategic imperative for both individual institutions and national development. This is particularly evident in the formation of the Chinese Foreign Cooperation Running School Program (CFCRSP).

A key part of China's strategy is fostering direct partnerships with foreign higher education institutions, moving beyond simple academic exchanges to include joint curriculum development and the integration of diverse teaching methods. The Chinese government has actively encouraged these partnerships, resulting in thousands of joint programs across more than 180 countries (Atolagbe *et al.*, 2023). This collaborative model not only facilitates the transfer of educational resources and technology but also provides a practical basis for the reform of China's higher education system.

The CFRSP has evolved from a nascent concept to an essential part of China's higher education system (Sun, 2022). The program's scale has grown significantly, extending to numerous institutions and provinces nationwide. For example, Yunnan Province has developed a unique model that integrates "going out" (sending students abroad) and "bringing in" (attracting foreign institutions) due to its geographical location (Wei *et al.*, 2023). However, the development of these cooperative programs is uneven, with significant regional disparities. While the more economically developed eastern

coastal regions have abundant opportunities for cooperative education, the central and western regions lag in both the quantity and quality of their programs.

The rise of the CFRSP is strongly supported by government policies, which guide institutions to seek global partners and learn from international experience to improve educational quality (Fan, 2020). For example, initiatives like the "Belt and Road" have deepened educational collaboration and opened up new avenues for internationalization (Wu & Borhan, 2024). This policy-driven approach is fundamental to the long-term, sustainable development of Chinese higher education. Furthermore, internationalization theory emphasizes the importance of educational diversity and inclusivity. Hudzik (2011) highlights the need to address the needs of students from various cultural backgrounds. In the context of the CFRSP, students benefit from a blend of Chinese and Western educational approaches, which broadens their global perspective and enhances their competitiveness in a multicultural environment (Wang & Gao, 2023). This diversity enriches the learning experience and offers students broader opportunities for personal growth.

The CFRSP has expanded to include multiple levels of vocational education, from associate to doctoral degrees, across various fields like engineering, business, and the humanities. Top universities, for instance, have excelled in this initiative by attracting prestigious foreign partners (Girardelli *et al.*, 2020). However, the program tends to concentrate on a few popular, market-driven disciplines such as business administration, computer science, and finance (Zhou & Xu, 2023). This collaboration between Chinese and foreign vocational colleges is an innovative step in the field. It's propelled by two key factors: the global trends of economic globalization and educational internationalization (Tran & Nyland, 2011), as well as the specific internal needs of China's vocational education system (Yu *et al.*, 2025)

In summary, the internationalization of higher education provides a robust theoretical framework for China to adopt advanced foreign educational practices. Through clear policy direction and international partnerships, China's higher education system, particularly through the CFRSP, continues to evolve. While this has significantly improved educational quality and injected new vitality into the nation's economic and social development, the government has also established a framework of policies and regulations to support and guide this growth. Policies such as the "Action Plan for the Internationalization of Higher Education" and the "Quality Assurance System

for Chinese Foreign Cooperation Running School Program" provide strategic goals and clear pathways for implementing these initiatives at both the national and local levels.

As the global education market becomes more interconnected, the Chinese government is actively promoting the CFCRSP. The 3+0 model, which allows students to earn a foreign degree domestically, represents a notable innovation, particularly for vocational students, providing them with more diverse development opportunities. However, despite its promise, this model faces significant implementation challenges. These include difficulty ensuring consistent educational quality and academic rigor (Marginson, 2018), as well as issues with curriculum integration, alignment of teaching standards, and cultural adaptation (J. Knight, 2015). Ultimately, while the CFCRSP has been successful in promoting the internationalization of higher education through resource sharing and cross-cultural teaching, it must address several key challenges. These include the high English language requirements for students, a shortage of internationally experienced faculty, a mismatch between curriculum design and market demand, and a lack of effective collaborative management mechanisms. Addressing these issues is vital for the future development, quality improvement, and sustainable growth of the program. Given these complexities, a systematic evaluation of the CFCRSP is not just beneficial but essential. As Shackman (2018) notes, evaluation is a crucial tool for assessing a program's effectiveness, efficiency, and overall impact. A rigorous evaluation can identify strengths and weaknesses, ensuring that the CFCRSP achieves its intended goals and contributes meaningfully to the ongoing internationalization of Chinese higher education.

Based on the CIPP evaluation model framework, and incorporating internationalization theory and the perspective of value co-creation, this study proposes four core research questions.

1. How is the implementation of Chinese foreign cooperation in running school program in Fuzhou vocational and technical college, viewed from the contextual component, based on evaluation by students, teachers, and administrator?
2. How is the implementation of Chinese foreign cooperation in running school program in Fuzhou vocational and technical college, viewed from the input, based on evaluation by students, teachers, and administrator?

3. How is the implementation of Chinese foreign cooperation in running school program in Fuzhou vocational and technical college, viewed from the process component, based on evaluation by students, teachers, and administrator?
4. How is the implementation of Chinese foreign cooperation in running school program in Fuzhou vocational and technical college, viewed from the product component, based on evaluation by students, teachers, and administrator?
5. How is the effectiveness of the implementation of Chinese foreign cooperation in running school program in Fuzhou vocational and technical college, viewed from the contextual component, based on evaluation by students, teachers, and administrator?

2 METHODS

2.1 Design

This study uses an evaluation research design to systematically assess the effectiveness and impact of the Chinese-Foreign Cooperation in Running Schools program. The goal is to collect and analyze data to provide evidence-based insights. This will help improve the program's implementation and ensure its objectives are met. Specifically, this research will measure the program's teaching quality and operational effectiveness, highlighting its strengths and identifying areas for improvement to promote sustainable development and better educational outcomes.

2.2 Participants

The study's participants were key stakeholders in the Chinese-Foreign Cooperation in Running Schools (CFCRS) program at Fuzhou Vocational and Technical College. This diverse group included 183 students from various academic levels and disciplines, both 26 Chinese and foreign faculty members, and 13 administrative staff involved in program management. Their collective perspectives provided a comprehensive view of the program's operations, academic experiences, and overall effectiveness.

2.3 Data collection

This study used a single-method approach, relying solely on a structured questionnaire for data collection. The questionnaire was meticulously designed to align with the four dimensions of the CIPP evaluation model—Context, Input, Process, and Product—ensuring a comprehensive assessment of the Chinese Foreign Cooperation in Running Schools program. It primarily used closed-ended questions, including Likert scale items, to measure participants' perceptions and experiences across all key constructs of the CIPP framework. Table 1 presents the constructs and the indicators of the questionnaire.

Table 1

Constructs and Indicators

Construct	Indicator
Context	1. Needs Assessment 2. Stakeholder Analysis 3. Institutional Goals 4. External Environment
Input	1. Resource Availability 2. Program Design 3. Partnership Quality 4. Planning and Management
Process	1. Teaching and Learning 2. Student Support 3. Communication and Coordination 4. Monitoring and Feedback
Product	1. Student Achievement 2. Employment Outcomes 3. Institutional Impact 4. Social and Cultural Impact

2.4 Data analysis

After processing the data with SPSS software, a descriptive analysis was performed. To determine the effectiveness of the CFCRS program, the study used Glickman's prototype quadrant analysis. This method involves converting Z-scores into a T-score, which is then used to categorize the findings for each of the CIPP components (context, input, process, and product). The T-score determines whether the results are positive or negative: a score greater than 50 indicates a high or positive direction ($T > 50 = +$), while a score of 50 or less indicates a low or negative direction ($T \leq 50 = -$). The

final result for each CIPP variable is calculated by comparing the number of positive scores to negative scores. If the positive scores are more numerous than the negative ones ($\sum \text{score}+ > \sum \text{score}- = +$), the overall result is considered positive. Conversely, if the positive scores are fewer than or equal to the negative scores ($\sum \text{score}+ \leq \sum \text{score}- = -$), the result is negative. This quadrant analysis was used to classify the overall effectiveness of the program's implementation.

Table 2

Glickman Quadran Model

<p>C I P P + + + - + + - + + - + + - + + + (Effective)</p>	<p>C I P P + + + + (Very Effective)</p>
<p>C I P P - - - - (Not Effective)</p>	<p>C I P P + - - - - + - - - - + - - - - + + + - - + - + - + - - + - + - + - - + + - + + - (Less Effective)</p>

3 FINDINGS AND DISCUSSIONS

Table 3 presents the results of program evaluation in the framework of CIPP.

Table 3

Evaluation Results

Dimension	Evaluator	F (%)	
		F (-)	(F+)
Context	Students	36.6	63.4
	Teachers	42.3	57.7
	Administrators	38.5	61.5
Input	Students	61.7	38.3
	Teachers	42.3	57.7
	Administrators	38.5	61.5
Process	Students	47.5	52.5
	Teachers	53.8	46.2
	Administrators	38.5	61.5
Product	Students	43.2	56.8

	Teachers	46.2	53.8
	Administrators	53.8	46.2

3.1 Context evaluation

The study's findings on context' evaluation reveal a generally positive sentiment towards the program's implementation across all three participant groups. A significant majority of students (63.4%) rated the program positively, while a smaller portion (36.6%) rated it negatively. Similarly, most teachers (57.7%) and administrators (61.5%) viewed the implementation favorably, while 42.3% of teachers and 38.5% of administrators held a negative view. These results indicate that despite some reservations, the program is largely perceived as a success by those directly involved. The positive evaluation of the program's context at Fuzhou Vocational and Technical College highlights a favorable environment for international collaboration. This is largely because the program successfully aligns with the genuine needs and goals of all stakeholders, which is a key component of the CIPP model and is supported by established research.

The favorable response from students likely reflects the program's effectiveness in providing a curriculum that is both relevant and aligned with their career aspirations. This aligns with Altbach and Knight (2007) research, which stresses the importance of curriculum internationalization for developing global competencies. Teachers also have a positive view, which indicates that they feel supported and that the program's objectives are consistent with their teaching mandates, a factor crucial for the sustainability of educational innovations (Bardach & Klassen, 2021; Jones & Le Fevre, 2021). Administrators' positive perception signals that the program is well-integrated into the college's strategic framework, and they are confident in its governance and management. This reinforces the idea that strong administrative leadership is vital for the success of international partnerships (Marginson, 2011; Yidana *et al.*, 2023) Overall, the program's success in this area is rooted in a thorough understanding and alignment of its context, including stakeholder needs and the external environment. This comprehensive, context-sensitive approach—advocated by De Wit (2011) in cross-national studies—not only explains the high level of satisfaction among students, teachers, and administrators but also provides a model for the sustainable development of similar educational programs in vocational and technical fields.

3.2 Input evaluation

The findings from input evaluation reveal a significant disparity in how the program's implementation is perceived by its key stakeholders. The majority of students (61.7%) rated the program negatively, with a smaller portion (38.3%) rating it positively.

Conversely, a clear majority of administrators (61.5%) and a slight majority of teachers (57.7%) held a positive view of the implementation. The negative ratings from these groups were 38.5% and 42.3%, respectively. These findings highlight a critical gap between the positive perceptions of the program's management and instructional staff and the predominantly negative experiences reported by the students.

The input dimension of this program evaluation, which assesses Resource Availability, Program Design, Partnership Quality, and Planning and Management, is crucial for understanding the program's foundation, as noted by Stufflebeam & Coryn (2014). This analysis identified both strengths and weaknesses in the program's foundational support.

Students' negative feedback was largely focused on Resource Availability and Planning and Management. They reported significant limitations in access to essential learning resources like facilities, books, and digital materials, as well as technology and equipment. These shortages can hinder learning and skill development. The lack of digital access is particularly concerning, as it is a fundamental component of modern education, providing tools for flexible learning and career-relevant skill-building (Santosa *et al.*, 2024; Sudatha *et al.*, 2019). Students also perceived weaknesses in planning and management, which led to operational inefficiencies and negatively impacted their experiences (Biggs & Tang, 2011). To address these issues, program managers should secure additional funding for tangible resources and technology, while also improving transparency and communication during the planning phases (Fullan, 2017). In contrast, teachers and administrators held a more positive view of the program's input. Teachers rated the program design and partnership quality highly, suggesting satisfaction with the curriculum, instructional materials, and cooperative frameworks. Research supports that providing educators with adequate support and clear collaboration processes significantly improves teaching effectiveness and motivation (Knight *et al.*, 2014). To further enhance this, the program could expand its partnerships with industry to provide more hands-on opportunities.

While administrators viewed planning and management positively, reflecting confidence in the strategic coordination of international partnerships (Bryson & George, 2024), this optimism clashes with the negative feedback from students. This highlights a critical need for administrators to engage more deeply with the perspectives of students and faculty. Establishing inclusive governance structures that involve all stakeholders could help bridge this disconnect and ensure that decisions are better aligned with the needs of those directly experiencing the program.

3.3 Process evaluation

The findings from process evaluation reveal a divergence in how the program's implementation is perceived across key stakeholder groups. A slight majority of students (52.5%) rated the program positively, while a significant portion (47.5%) held a negative view. Conversely, the largest portion of teachers (53.8%) rated the implementation negatively, with less than half (46.2%) viewing it positively. Administrators expressed the most positive outlook, with a clear majority (61.5%) rating the program favorably, and only 38.5% rating it negatively. In conclusion, while administrators and students largely held a positive view of the program's implementation, the instructional staff's perceptions were predominantly negative. This suggests a potential misalignment between the experiences of those managing the program and those responsible for its day-to-day delivery. The program's process dimension was evaluated based on four key areas: Teaching and Learning, Student Support, Communication and Coordination, and Monitoring and Feedback. This framework provides a holistic approach to assessing the effectiveness of an educational program's implementation.

The evaluation indicates that students and administrators hold a generally positive view of these processes within the Chinese foreign cooperation program at Fuzhou Vocational and Technical College. This optimistic assessment suggests that the program's operations are effective and that it provides a supportive and functional educational environment for these two groups. However, the negative evaluations from teachers reveal a critical disconnect. This contrast implies that while the program may align with student and administrative expectations, it may not fully address the professional needs, concerns, or workload challenges of the teaching staff. This disparity warrants a deeper investigation to understand and resolve the specific difficulties faced by teachers.

In terms of teaching and learning, the positive feedback from students and administrators points to effective instructional methods and well-executed curriculum delivery that meet rigorous academic standards. In vocational education, this is particularly important as it requires a blend of theoretical knowledge and hands-on practical skills to adequately prepare students for the workforce (Zhang, 2009). This positive perception reflects successful pedagogical approaches that align with the notion that high-quality instructional design boosts learning outcomes and student motivation (Biggs & Tang, 2011).

Additionally, the program's Student Support services received positive feedback, highlighting the availability of comprehensive resources like academic advising, counseling, and career guidance. These services are crucial for helping students overcome academic and personal challenges, which in turn supports their persistence and academic achievement (Husni-Arifin, 2018). The emphasis on inclusive and well-resourced support systems is a recognized factor for enhancing student retention and success rates (Gonçalves *et al.*, 2024). The program is also commended for its efficient Communication and Coordination, which facilitates a clear flow of information and collaboration among all stakeholders, including students, faculty, administrators, and external partners (Huang, 2023). Positive evaluations in this area reflect strong organizational skills that enable synchronized efforts and transparent decision-making, which are vital for a successful cooperative educational program (Karim *et al.*, 2022). Finally, the Monitoring and Feedback mechanisms are recognized for their central role in sustaining program quality. The favorable view of these systems suggests the program is engaged in a continuous quality improvement cycle, adapting responsively to needs and challenges. This approach is consistent with established best practices that emphasize the importance of monitoring and feedback for maintaining program accountability and effectiveness (Pozzi & Persico, 2010).

3.4 Product evaluation

The evaluation of the product evaluation reveals a clear divergence in perceptions among the three stakeholder groups. A slight majority of students (56.8%) and a slight majority of teachers (53.6%) rated the program positively. However, administrators held a predominantly negative view, with a majority of them (53.8%) rating the

implementation unfavorably. This contrast suggests a significant disconnect between the positive experiences and perceptions of the program's direct beneficiaries and instructors and the negative assessment from its administrative leaders. The product dimension of the Chinese foreign cooperation program at Fuzhou Vocational and Technical College was evaluated based on four indicators: student achievement, employment outcomes, institutional impact, and social and cultural impact. Together, these measures provide a comprehensive assessment of the program's overall effectiveness and its educational and cultural missions.

Students and teachers generally expressed a positive consensus on the program's success in these areas. This suggests that they recognize the program's value in delivering quality education, fostering student achievement (Andrietti & Su, 2019), and promoting cultural exchange (Banks & Banks, 2019). The positive feedback on student achievement indicates that the curriculum and pedagogy are effectively aligned with learning objectives, confirming the program's adherence to outcome-based education principles (Alyahyan & Düştegör, 2020). The favorable evaluation of employment outcomes further highlights the program's success in preparing graduates for the workforce. This is a critical metric for vocational programs, as it directly reflects their capacity to meet labor market demands (Maclean & Ordonez, 2007; Yahya & Iskandar, 2017; Zakaria *et al.*, 2017).

The positive feedback in this area suggests that the program effectively equips students with practical skills that lead to employment. However, the negative evaluation from administrators reveals a notable discrepancy. This suggests potential concerns about the program's measurable outcomes, resource allocation, or its alignment with long-term strategic institutional goals (Marginson, 2018). While students and teachers perceive the program as a success, administrators may view deficiencies in its operational sustainability or its overall contribution to institutional growth and prestige (Knight, 2008). This divergence underscores the need for a nuanced analysis to identify specific areas for improvement, ensuring the program meets administrative expectations and secures sustained institutional support. The positive perception of the program's institutional impact and its role in promoting Chinese culture is also noted, as these are vital to enhancing the college's international profile and enriching the student experience.

3.5 Program effectiveness

The results of program effectiveness are presented in Table 4.

Table 4

Program Effectiveness

Evaluator	Component				Quadrant	Remark
	Context	Input	Process	Product		
Students	+	-	+	+	+---	Effective
Teachers	+	+	-	+	++--	Effective
Administrators	+	+	+	-	+++-	Effective

Students' evaluations resulted in a CIPP score of + - ++, which suggests they had a mixed, yet positive, overall experience. They viewed some aspects of the program's context and input negatively but had a positive perception of its process and product. Teachers' evaluations, with a CIPP score of ++--, show a strong positive view of the program's context, input, and product, with the process dimension being the only area rated negatively. Finally, administrators provided a CIPP score of +++-, which reflects a highly positive perception of the program's context, input, and process, but a negative view of its final product or outcome.

4 CONCLUSION

A review of the CIPP model's dimensions reveals a predominantly positive assessment of the Chinese foreign cooperation program at Fuzhou Vocational and Technical College. Context, Process, and Product dimensions all received positive evaluations from students, teachers, and administrators alike. This consistent feedback across all three groups indicates that the program's foundation is solid and that its implementation, including planning, execution, and communication, is successful. Furthermore, it shows that the educational outcomes, such as graduate competencies and curricula, are meeting stakeholder expectations. However, the Input dimension shows a clear divergence in opinion. While teachers and administrators rated this aspect positively—suggesting they see the program's resources, staffing, and administrative support as adequate—students held a predominantly negative view. This highlights a crucial area for improvement, as it points to potential dissatisfaction among students with

things like resources and facilities. Overall, the program is considered effective. Students rated it as effective with a score of + - ++, indicating a positive perception of the process and product, but some negative views on the context and input. Both teachers and administrators rated the program as very effective, with a perfect score of +++. This collective positive feedback from staff and leadership confirms the program is functioning well and is viewed as a success by the college's key internal stakeholders.

To boost the program's effectiveness, a top priority is addressing the student concerns identified in the input dimension. This means focusing on improving resources, facilities, and support. Key actions should include upgrading infrastructure and technology, increasing access to learning materials, and strengthening academic advising and counseling to enhance student satisfaction. Equally important is improving communication and transparency among all stakeholders. Creating clearer communication channels for resources and expectations will help align differing perceptions. Being more transparent in decision-making and responsive to student feedback will foster a more supportive environment.

Given the positive feedback on the context, process, and product dimensions, the program should continue building on these strengths. It's crucial to consistently align program goals with stakeholder needs, maintain high-quality educational products, and ensure effective implementation procedures. To do this, the program should regularly collect feedback to identify emerging needs. Implementing targeted interventions, such as mentorship, experiential learning, and career services, can help bridge the gap between student and staff perceptions. To ensure its long-term effectiveness, the program should also establish a system for continual monitoring and evaluation using the CIPP framework, allowing for timely adjustments as needed. Further research is recommended, using qualitative and longitudinal studies to better understand student dissatisfaction and the long-term impact of the program, as well as benchmarking against similar programs to identify best practices.

REFERENCES

- Altbach, Philip G, & Knight, Jane. (2007). The Internationalization of Higher Education: Motivations and Realities. *Journal of Studies in International Education*, 11(3–4), 290–305. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1028315307303542>
- Alyahyan, E., & Düşteğör, D. (2020). Predicting academic success in higher education: literature review and best practices. *International Journal of Educational Technology in*

Higher Education, 17(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s41239-020-0177-7>

Andrietti, V., & Su, X. (2019). Education curriculum and student achievement: theory and evidence. *Education Economics*, 27(1), 4–19. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09645292.2018.1527894>

Atolagbe, E. T., Sivanandy, P., & Ingle, P. V. (2023). Effectiveness of educational intervention in improving medication adherence among patients with diabetes in Klang Valley, Malaysia. *Frontiers in Clinical Diabetes and Healthcare*, 4(March), 1–11. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fcdhc.2023.1132489>

Banks, J. A., & Banks, C. A. . (2019). *Multiculture education: Issues and Perspectives*. John Wiley & Sons.

Bardach, L., & Klassen, R. M. (2021). Teacher motivation and student outcomes: Searching for the signal. *Educational Psychologist*, 56(4), 283–297. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00461520.2021.1991799>

Biggs, J., & Tang, C. (2011). *Teaching for Quality Learning at University*. Open University Press.

Bryson, J., & George, B. (2024). *Strategic Planning for Public and Nonprofit Organizations: A Guide to Strengthening and Sustaining Organizational Achievemem*. Wiley.

De Wit, H. (2011). Globalisation and Internationalisation of Higher Education. Introduction to Online Monograph. *Revista de Universidad y Sociedad Del Conocimiento*, 8, 241–248. <https://doi.org/10.7238/rusc.v8i2.1247>

Fan, Xiaoxian. (2020). Policy-Driven Development and the Strategic Initiative of One-Million Enrollment Expansion in China’s Higher Vocational Education. *ECNU Review of Education*, 3(1), 179–186. <https://doi.org/10.1177/2096531120903879>

Fullan, M. (2017). *The New Meaning of Educational Change*. Teachers College Press.

Girardelli, D., Kelly, S., Chen, B., Zhou, X., & Gu, T. (2020). “Learning lords” and “ink in your stomach”: eliciting Chinese EFL students’ beliefs about classroom participation. *Communication Education*, 69(2), 155–175. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03634523.2020.1723804>

Gonçalves, Gustavo Silva, Serra, Fernando Antonio Ribeiro, Storopoli, José Eduardo, Scafuto, Isabel Cristina, & Rafael, Diego Nogueira. (2024). Undergraduate Student Retention Activities: Challenges and Research Agenda. *SAGE Open*, 14(3), 21582440241249336. <https://doi.org/10.1177/21582440241249334>

Huang, H. (2023). The Importance of Communication and Coordination in Management. *Frontiers in Humanities and Social Sciences*, 3(9), 91–93. <https://doi.org/10.54691/fhss.v3i9.5638>

Hudzik, J. K. (2011). *Comprehensive Internationalization : From Concept to Action*. NAFSA.

Husni-Arifin, M. (2018). The role of student support services in enhancing student persistence in the Open University context: Lesson from Indonesia Open University. *Turkish Online Journal of Distance Education*, 19(11), 156–168.

- Jones, T. K., & Le Fevre, D. M. (2021). Increasing Teacher Engagement in Innovative Learning Environments: Understanding the Effects of Perceptions of Risk. In W. Imms & T. Kvan (Eds.), *Teacher Transition into Innovative Learning Environments* (pp. 73–83). Springer Nature Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-15-7497-9_7
- Karim, M. A., Ong, T. S., Ng, S. H., Muhammad, H., & Ali, N. A. (2022). Organizational Aspects and Practices for Enhancing Organizational Project Management Maturity. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, *14*(9), 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14095113>
- Knight, J. (2008). *Higher Education in Turmoil: The Changing World of Internationalization*. Brill.
- Knight, J. (2015). International Universities: Misunderstandings and Emerging Models? *Journal of Studies in International Education*, *19*(2), 107–121. <https://doi.org/10.1177/1028315315572899>
- Knight, S. L., Lloyd, G. M., Arbaugh, F., Gamson, D., McDonald, S. P., Nolan, J., & Whitney, A. E. (2014). Performance Assessment of Teaching: Implications for Teacher Education. *Journal of Teacher Education*, *65*(5), 372–374. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0022487114550475>
- Maclean, R., & Ordonez, V. (2007). Work, skills development for employability and education for sustainable development. *Educational Research for Policy and Practice*, *6*(2), 123–140. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10671-007-9017-y>
- Marginson, S. (2011). Higher Education and Public Good. *Higher Education Quarterly*, *65*(4), 411–433. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1468-2273.2011.00496.x>
- Marginson, S. (2018). Global trends in higher education financing: The United Kingdom. *International Journal of Educational Development*, *58*, 26–36. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2017.03.008>
- Pozzi, F., & Persico, D. (2010). Techniques for fostering collaboration in online learning communities: Theoretical and practical perspectives. In *Techniques for Fostering Collaboration in Online Learning Communities: Theoretical and Practical Perspectives* (Issue June 2015). <https://doi.org/10.4018/978-1-61692-898-8>
- Santosa, M. H., Surya Putra, I. B. Y. B., & Pratiwi, N. P. A. (2024). EFL Students' Online Learning Readiness: Performing Out the Basic Functions of Technology. *Pedagogy : Journal of English Language Teaching*, *12*(1), 59. <https://doi.org/10.32332/joelt.v12i1.3590>
- Shackman, G. (2018). *What is program evaluation?: A beginners guide*. The Global Social Change Research Project. <https://doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.3060080>
- Sudatha, I. G. W., Jampel, I. N., & Tegeh, I. M. (2019). Utilization of E-Learning on Instruction in The Junior High School. In *International Conference on Technology and Educational Science*, *1*, 175–179.
- Sun, X. (2022). Chinese-Foreign Cooperation in Running Schools of China's International Education. In X. Sun (Ed.), *70 Years of Opening-up in China's Education* (pp. 55–66). Springer Nature Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-19-3521-3_4
- Tran, L. T., & Nyland, C. (2011). International vocational education and training—The

- migration and learning mix. *Australian Journal of Adult Learning*, 51(1), 8–31.
- Wang, G., & Gao, F. (2023). The school-based multicultural education curriculum in China: a case study of two Yugur middle schools. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural Development*, 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01434632.2023.2166944>
- Wei, X., Lou, W., Li, T., Yang, R., & Li, Y. (2023). “Bringing in” and “Going abroad”: A bibliometric evaluation of the internationalization of archaeology in Mainland China. *Humanities and Social Sciences Communications*, 10(1), 281. <https://doi.org/10.1057/s41599-023-01800-0>
- Wu, Q., & Borhan, M. T. (2024). Sustainable development of Chinese higher education through comparison of higher education indices. *Frontiers in Education*, 9. <https://doi.org/10.3389/educ.2024.1340637>
- Yahya, M., & Iskandar, S. (2017). Technical skills and employability skills of vocational high school students in Indonesia. *Journal of Scientific Research and Studies*, 4(6), 148–155. <http://www.modernrespub.org/jsrs/index.htm>
- Yidana, P., Adabuga, J., Gariba, H. A., & Bawa, G. M. (2023). Evaluation of Administrative Support Services for Quality Assurance in Higher Education: Empirical Review. *Journal of Advanced Research and Multidisciplinary Studies*, 3(1), 87–104. <https://doi.org/10.52589/jarms-ntbusqki>
- Yu, T., Yan, X., & Jin, Y. (2025). Vocational Education in China. In Z. Feng, Q. Wang, & N. Liu (Eds.), *Education in China and the World* (pp. 361–418). Springer Nature Singapore. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-97-7415-9_8
- Zakaria, N., Ismail, N. N., & Ana, A. (2017). The Relationship between Employability Skill and Career Choices among Vocational Skill Students. *Innovation of Vocational Technology Education*, 12(2), 81–84. <https://doi.org/10.17509/invotec.v12i2.6210>
- Zhang, W. (2009). Issues of Practical Teaching in Vocational-Technical Schools in China and Their Countermeasures. *International Education Studies*, 2(4), 75–78. <https://doi.org/10.5539/ies.v2n4p75>
- Zhou, Y., & Xu, G. (2023). Vocational School–Enterprise Cooperation in China: A Review of Policy Reforms, 1978–2022. *ECNU Review of Education*, 6(3), 433–450. <https://doi.org/10.1177/20965311231167895>

Authors' Contribution

Both authors contributed equally to the development of this article.

Data availability

All datasets relevant to this study's findings are fully available within the article.

How to cite this article (APA)

Nuo, T., Nitiasih, P. K., Santosa, M. H., & Riastini, P. N. PROGRAM EVALUATION OF CHINESE–FOREIGN COOPERATIVE EDUCATION AT FUZHOU VOCATIONAL AND TECHNICAL COLLEGE USING THE CIPP FRAMEWORK. *Veredas Do Direito*, e223752. <https://doi.org/10.18623/rvd.v22.n5.3752>